IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW MEXICO

SECURITIES AND EXCHANGE COMMISSION,

Plaintiff,

vs. Case Number: 1:12-cv-00257-JB-GBW

LARRY GOLDSTONE, CLARENCE G. SIMMONS, III. and JANE E. STARRETT.

Defendants.

**DEFENDANTS' NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY** 

On March 24, 2015, the Supreme Court imposed strict limits on liability for opinion statements in securities cases—an issue central to Defendants' Motions for Summary Judgment. *See* Doc. 201 at 18, 42. In Omnicare, Inc. v. Laborers District Council Constr. Indus. Pension Fund, No. 13-435, slip op. (Mar. 24, 2015), the Court confirmed that actual disbelief is required to establish misrepresentation liability for opinions, holding that "a sincere statement of pure opinion is not an 'untrue statement of material fact,' regardless whether an investor can ultimately prove the belief wrong," and that the prohibition on untrue statements of *fact* "does not allow investors to second-guess inherently subjective and uncertain assessments." 9. Misrepresentation liability for opinions "requires proving an issuer did not believe them." 16.

The Court also considered whether a sincerely held opinion can be misleading by omission, observing that "liability [exists] only for the omission of material facts that cannot be squared with [] a fair reading" of the opinion. 14. Importantly, (i) this inquiry "always depends on context" such as "hedges, disclaimers, or qualifications," which can "make clear the real tentativeness of [the issuer's] belief" (14, 19-20); (ii) "opinions sometimes rest on a weighing of competing facts" and do not become misleading "when[ever] an issuer knows, but fails to

Case 1:12-cv-00257-JB-GBW Document 353 Filed 03/27/15 Page 2 of 5

disclose, some fact cutting the other way" (13); (iii) "a statement of opinion is not misleading

just because external facts show the opinion to be incorrect" (11); and (iv) reasonable investors

"do[] not expect that every fact known to an issuer supports its opinion" (13).

Here, the SEC lacks evidence challenging the sincerity of Defendants' OTTI opinion, or

demonstrating that reasonable investors would consider that opinion misleading in context.

Defendants were not required to disclose the alleged "competing facts" cutting against their

opinion. 13. The Form 10-K cautioned that OTTI is an "accounting estimate ... requir[ing]

management judgment" as to Thornburg's ability to hold assets, that Thornburg "might need to

selectively sell assets ... to meet [future] margin calls," and that "there is no assurance that

[Thornburg] ... will be able to satisfy additional margin calls."

Dated: March 27, 2015

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Randall R. Lee

Randall R. Lee

Jessica F. Kurzban

Daniel R. Crump

WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE and DORR LLP

350 S. Grand Avenue, Suite 2100

Los Angeles, CA 90071

Telephone: (213) 443-5300

Facsimile: (213) 443-5400

randall.lee@wilmerhale.com

jessica.kurzban@wilmerhale.com

daniel.crump@wilmerhale.com

- 2 -

John A. Valentine

WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE and DORR LLP

1875 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20006

Telephone: (202) 663-6000 Facsimile: (202) 663-6363

john.valentine@wilmerhale.com

Attorneys for Defendants Larry Goldstone and Clarence G. Simmons, III

-and-

Jerry L. Marks

Robert J. Liubicic

MILBANK, TWEED, HADLEY & McCLOY LLP

601 S. Figueroa Street, 30th Floor

Los Angeles, CA 90017

Telephone: (213) 892-4000 Facsimile: (213) 629-5063 Email: jmarks@milbank.com rliubicic@milbank.com

Attorneys for Defendant Jane E. Starrett

-and-

Bruce Hall

Andrew G. Schultz

RODEY, DICKASON, SLOAN, AKIN & ROBB, P.A.

P. O. Box 1888

Albuquerque, NM 87103

Telephone: (505) 765-5900 Facsimile: (505) 768-7395

bhall@rodey.com aschultz@rodey.com

Attorneys for Defendants Larry Goldstone, Clarence G. Simmons, III, and Jane E. Starrett

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that on March 27, 2015 the foregoing Notice of Supplemental Authority was electronically filed with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system that that will send notification of such filing to all counsel of record.

Michael H. Hoses Assistant United States Attorney P.O. Box 607 Albuquerque, NM 87103 michael.hoses@usdoj.gov

Stephen C. McKenna Gregory Kasper Dugan Bliss Securities & Exchange Commission 1801 California Street, Suite 1500 Denver, CO 80202 mckennas@sec.gov kasperg@sec.gov blissd@sec.gov

# MILBANK, TWEED, HADLEY & MCCOY LLP

Thomas A. Arena 1 Chase Manhattan Plaza New York, NY 10005 Telephone: (212) 530-5000 Facsimile: (212) 530-5219 tarena@milbank.com

# WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP

John A. Valentine April N. Williams 1875 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20006 Telephone: (202) 663-6000 Facsimile: (202) 663-6363 john.valentine@wilmerhale.com april.williams@wilmerhale.com MILBANK, TWEED, HADLEY & MCCLOY LLP
Jerry L. Marks
Robert J. Liubicic
Alisa Schlesinger
Elena Kilberg
601 S. Figueroa Street, 30<sup>th</sup> Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90017

Telephone: (213) 892-4000
Facsimile: (213) 629-5063
jmarks@milbank.com
rliubicic@milbank.com
aschlesinger@milbank.com
ekilberg@milbank.com

## WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP

Randall R. Lee
Jessica F. Kurzban
350 South Grand Ave., Suite 2100
Los Angeles, CA 90071
Telephone: (213) 443-5300
Facsimile: (213) 443-5400
randall.lee@wilmerhale.com
jessica.kurzban@wilmerhale.com

## WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP

Christopher W. Johnstone 950 Page Mill Road Palo Alto, CA 94304

Telephone: (650) 858-6000 Facsimile: (650) 858-6100

chris.johnstone@wilmerhale.com alanna.buchanan@wilmerhale.com

RODEY, DICKASON, SLOAN, AKIN & ROBB, P.A.
Andrew G. Schultz
Bruce D. Hall
Melanie B. Stambaugh
201 3rd Street NW, Suite 2200
P.O. Box 1888
Albuquerque, NM 87102
aschultz@rodey.com
bhall@rodey.com
mstambaugh@rodey.com

#### WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP

By <u>/s/ Daniel Crump</u>
Daniel Crump